

Social Assistance and Minimum Income Levels and Replacement Rates Dataset

Assembled by Jinxian Wang and Olaf van Vliet*

Leiden University

December 2016

Abstract

The Social Assistance and Minimum Income Levels and Replacement Rates Dataset provides two new indicators for comparisons of social assistance and minimum income benefits across countries and over time, namely real net minimum income benefit levels and net minimum income benefit replacement rates. The dataset contains information for 33 countries for the period 1990 – 2009. For information on social assistance and minimum income benefits, the dataset draws upon information from Nelson's (2013) dataset. The minimum income replacement rates are comparable to unemployment replacement rates.

1. Introduction

Until recently, comparative studies on social policy and labor market institutions have paid little attention to social assistance and minimum income benefits compared to other welfare state programs such as labor market policies and pension schemes. One explanation for this lack of attention might be that data on other welfare state programs, most notably social expenditure data provided by the OECD, were relatively easily available, whereas data on social assistance and minimum income benefits were not. This came to an end in 2006, when Nelson published the first version of the Social Assistance and Minimum Income Protection Dataset. More recently, Van Mechelen et al. (2011) published the CSB-Minimum Income Protection Indicators Dataset.

* E-mail: j.wang@law.leidenuniv.nl and o.p.van.vliet@law.leidenuniv.nl. Department of Economics, Leiden University. The dataset is available from the following website: <https://www.universiteitleiden.nl/en/law/institute-for-tax-law-and-economics/economics/data-sets/the-social-assistance-and-minimum-income-levels-and-replacement-rates-dataset>

To compare social policies across countries and over time, many empirical studies have relied on social expenditure data, but these are not available for minimum income benefits. Furthermore, comparative studies of welfare state programs have increasingly turned to the use of social right indicators, such as income replacement rates. These studies are mainly focused on international comparative analyses of unemployment benefits, sick pay benefits and pension benefits (e.g. Allan and Scruggs, 2004; Hicks and Freeman, 2009; Korpi and Palme, 2003; Scruggs et al., 2014 and Van Vliet and Caminada, 2012). Much less attention has been paid to the international comparative analysis of minimum income benefits.

The aim of the Social Assistance and Minimum Income Levels and Replacement Rates Dataset, assembled by Wang and Van Vliet, is to provide an essential dataset for all kind of cross-national analyses related to minimum income benefit programs. We introduce two types of quantitative indicators of minimum income benefits, namely the real net minimum income benefit levels and the net minimum income replacement rates. The benefit level is a relatively straightforward measure of (one dimension of) the generosity of minimum income benefits (Olaskoaga et al., 2013). The minimum income replacement rate, on the other hand, gives an impression of the benefit generosity relative to labor income. These indicators are based on data from the Social Assistance and Minimum Income Protection Dataset (Nelson, 2013) and the Unemployment Replacement Rates Dataset among 34 Welfare States, 1971-2009: An Update, Extension and Modification of the Scruggs' Welfare State Entitlement Data Set (Van Vliet and Caminada, 2012).

The Social Assistance and Minimum Income Levels and Replacement Rates Dataset allows researchers and public policy analysts to compare the generosity of minimum income benefits across 33 countries between 1990-2009. The data can be used to address questions of how the generosity of welfare states varies across countries and over time. Subsequently, researchers can use the data to explore the sources of this variation (Wang et al., 2015) Furthermore, the dataset can be used by scholars to examine the effects of benefit programs on labor market outcomes (Been and Van Vliet, 2017).

2. Origin of the idea

Social Assistance and Minimum Income Levels and Replacement Rates Dataset, assembled by Wang and Van Vliet (Version December 2016), builds upon two other datasets. Firstly, data on social assistance and minimum income benefits is provided by Nelson's (2013) Social Assistance and Minimum Income Protection Dataset. Secondly, it elaborates on the concept of net income

replacement rates as used in the work on unemployment replacement rates, developed by Scruggs et al. (2014) and Van Vliet and Caminada (2012).

3. Citation

A more detailed description of the data and method is available in the following article:

Wang, J., and O. van Vliet (2016) Social assistance and minimum income benefits: Benefit levels, replacement rates and policies across 26 OECD countries, 1990-2009. *European Journal of Social Security* 18(4): 333-555.

Please cite this article when referring to the data.

4. Definition: real net minimum income benefit levels

To construct the indicator of real net minimum income benefits, our dataset relies on data from the Social Assistance and Minimum Income Protection Dataset (Nelson, 2013). Nelson's (2013) dataset contains annual data on benefit levels for a fairly large number of industrialized countries. The institutional information in the dataset is based on national sources and legislation. The dataset contains disaggregated data on several income components. Following Nelson (2013), we define net minimum income benefits as the net income from a benefit package consisting of basic social assistance, child supplements, refundable tax credits and other benefits. One-time social assistance payments to cover unexpected and urgent needs or regular supplements to cover exceptional needs are not included in this benefit package.

Furthermore, housing benefits are not included in the calculation of our main indicators of net minimum income benefits. In many countries, housing benefits depend on actual housing costs. As the actual housing costs vary strongly across regions within countries, the inclusion of housing benefits in the calculated benefit package requires demanding assumptions on the housing costs. Consequently, the assumptions regarding the housing costs strongly determine the calculated housing benefits and so the calculated net minimum income benefit levels (Eardly et al., 1996; Kuivalainen, 2003; Van Mechelen et al, 2011). The consequence of the decision not to include housing benefits is that our indicators underestimate the minimum income, but the advantage is that our indicators give a clearer indication of the development of social assistance benefits. Moreover, not including the housing benefits in the minimum income benefit package has the advantage that the benefit package is comparable to the benefit package used in studies on unemployment benefits.

Therefore, our minimum income replacement rates are comparable to unemployment replacement rates (Scruggs et al., 2014; Van Vliet and Caminada, 2012).

Nevertheless, the dataset also includes a measure of minimum income benefit levels including housing benefits. These benefit levels are higher than the benefit levels without housing benefits. With regard to the developments between 1990 and 2009, these are comparable for the measures with and without housing benefits for all countries but Sweden.

In order to compare benefit levels across countries and over time, we transfer all benefit levels into U.S. dollars, adjusted for purchasing power (PPP) and inflation (CPI=100). Data on PPP are taken from Penn World Table (Heston et al., 2012) and for the CPI we rely on data from the World Bank (2012). An additional step is required for the Eurozone countries, as the PPPs in the year before the introduction of the euro are also expressed in euros, whereas the benefit levels are expressed in the national currencies. To convert the national currencies into euros, our dataset relies on exchange rate data from the European Commission (2014).

For the Eurozone countries, the real minimum income benefit levels are calculated as follows:

$$\text{Real minimum income benefit} = ((\text{minimum income benefit}/\text{exchange rate from euro to national currency})/\text{PPP})*(100/\text{CPI})$$

For the non-Eurozone countries, the real minimum income benefit levels are calculated as follows:

$$\text{Real minimum income benefit} = (\text{minimum income benefit}/\text{PPP})*(100/\text{CPI})$$

The dataset contains data for three different household types: single person households, lone parent households with two children, and two parent households with two children.

5. Definition: net minimum income benefit replacement rates

The net minimum income replacement rate is defined as the ratio of the net minimum income benefits to the net average production worker wage. For the replacement rate, we neither adjust the nominator nor the denominator for exchange rates, purchasing power, or inflation, as these adjustments would be cancelled out in the ratio. The net average production worker wage refers to the in-work wage after deducting taxes. Data on minimum income benefits are taken from the Social Assistance and Minimum Income Protection Dataset (Nelson, 2013). For the average production worker wage, we use data from the OECD and Unemployment Replacement Rates Dataset among 34

Welfare States, 1971-2009: An Update, Extension and Modification of the Scruggs' Welfare State Entitlement Data Set (Van Vliet and Caminada, 2012).

It should be noted that in most cases, minimum income 'replacement rates' do not indicate the fraction of the income from work that is actually 'replaced' by income transfer programs, as is for instance the case for unemployment replacement benefits. The reason for this difference is that unemployed workers often receive unemployment benefits first before they are entitled to social assistance benefits. Hence, minimum income replacement rates and unemployment replacement rates are the same type of ratios as they share the same denominator, but the meaning of the term 'replacement rate' is slightly different.

6. Summary statistics

The tables below provide a summary of the data. Tables 1 – 3 present the real net minimum income benefit levels for a single person household without children, a lone parent household with two children and a two parent household with two children respectively. Table 4 presents a summary measure of the real net minimum income benefit levels (the mean of the three household types).

Tables 5 – 7 present the net minimum income replacement rates for a single person household without children, a lone parent household with two children and a two parent household with two children respectively. Table 8 presents a summary measure of the net minimum income replacement rates (the mean of the three household types).

Table 1. Real net minimum income benefit levels for single person household without children

	1990	1991	1992	1993	1994	1995	1996	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009
Australia	7,101	7,462	7,698	7,735	7,712	7,711	7,910	8,137	8,037	7,968	7,528	7,744	7,755	7,800	7,926	7,941	8,093	8,124	8,030	8,179
Austria	5,095	4,933	5,460	5,661	5,603	5,786	5,703	5,533	5,525	5,698	5,701	5,703	5,832	5,754	5,869	5,859	6,059	6,103	6,155	6,255
Belgium	7,742	7,998	7,993	8,222	8,290	8,671	8,600	8,205	8,177	8,228	8,168	8,130	8,485	8,506	8,682	8,545	8,407	8,778	8,916	9,391
Bulgaria	1,231	1,039	1,196
Canada	8,099	8,496	8,693	8,667	8,824	8,271	6,826	6,741	6,608	6,550	6,379	6,226	6,092	5,982	6,042	6,037	5,974	6,080	6,238	6,099
Cyprus	5,786	5,860	6,007	5,799	6,237	7,021
Czech Republic	.	.	.	4,268	3,911	3,734	3,494	3,445	3,284	3,173	3,006	3,398	3,367	3,408	3,279	3,452	3,493	1,980	1,873	1,855
Denmark	5,059	5,064	5,227	5,297	7,269	8,700	8,637	8,545	8,623	8,674	8,712	8,789	8,845	8,999	9,257	9,460	9,618	9,748	9,440	9,762
Estonia	1,354	1,109	1,118	1,047	982	919	846	806	797	769	1,095	1,013	1,078	1,059	1,085
Finland	6,149	5,673	4,913	4,243	4,631	5,126	4,990	4,888	4,689	4,724	4,576	4,588	4,624	4,687	4,805	4,884	4,915	4,878	4,753	4,918
France	4,481	4,435	4,491	4,684	4,788	4,855	4,966	4,929	4,962	5,173	5,188	5,276	5,222	5,250	5,216	5,339	5,346	5,425	5,423	5,565
Germany	.	4,424	4,428	4,494	4,462	4,521	4,456	4,309	4,325	4,443	4,532	4,551	4,575	4,626	4,655	5,488	5,533	5,542	5,499	5,616
Hungary	.	.	6,996	7,877	7,831	4,992	3,473	2,591	2,087	1,846	1,690	1,562	1,547	1,561	1,615	1,562	1,772	2,288	1,849	1,743
Ireland	6,983	7,077	7,001	6,167	6,371	6,655	6,861	7,430	7,166	6,937	6,702	6,761	6,970	6,932	7,252	7,898	8,464	9,137	9,645	10,771
Italy	10,307	9,867	9,158	7,484	6,841	5,863	5,977	5,873	5,725	6,811	6,850	7,028	7,110	7,265	7,457	7,764	8,079	8,325	8,555	8,909
Japan	5,344	5,394	5,547	5,674	5,739	6,012	6,122	5,998	6,179	6,367	6,661	6,936	7,202	7,394	7,644	8,011	8,260	8,518	8,636	8,968
Latvia	744	764	772	708	557	754
Lithuania	991	947	996	1,187	1,429	1,740
Luxembourg	8,617	9,189	9,555	11,413	11,550	12,343	12,078	12,082	11,941	12,059	11,850	12,198	12,249	12,733	12,911	13,320	13,450	13,891	13,932	16,701
Malta	6,582	7,591	7,853	7,017	6,920	6,879
Netherlands	10,263	10,385	10,534	10,916	10,797	11,673	11,262	10,704	10,405	10,501	10,425	10,566	10,386	10,530	10,806	10,739	11,190	11,540	11,745	11,719
New Zealand	5,731	5,155	5,189	5,219	5,214	5,162	5,190	5,262	5,209	5,248	5,429	5,374	5,372	5,546	5,543	6,005	6,034	6,091	6,088	6,078
Norway	7,715	7,634	7,654	7,530	8,472	9,215	10,017	11,636	9,457	10,717	10,403	10,467	10,653	10,703	10,718	10,706	10,658	10,642	10,265	9,936
Poland	6,851	4,860	3,742	3,583	3,175	2,828	2,973	2,978	3,016	2,897	2,881	2,895	2,910	2,789	2,658
Portugal	2,397	2,358	2,344	2,426	2,464	2,444	2,458	2,442	2,553	2,699	2,748	2,794	2,798	2,944
Romania	603	530	522
Slovakia	.	.	.	4,095	2,976	2,715	2,852	3,066	2,983	2,524	2,334	2,179	2,281	1,625	1,555	1,597	1,676	1,986	2,074	2,123
Slovenia	4,549	3,908	3,429	3,106	2,608	4,334	3,951	3,717	3,796	3,789	3,810	3,826	3,820
Spain	11,390	10,450	9,240	7,595	6,590	6,271	6,046	5,658	5,431	5,334	5,304	5,584	5,451	5,321	5,195	5,178	5,107	5,182	5,184	5,487
Sweden	5,461	5,181	5,361	5,079	5,052	4,948	4,994	4,323	4,392	4,304	4,415	4,289	4,358	4,447	4,669	4,731	4,809	4,828	4,797	4,783
Switzerland	6,748	6,773	6,817	6,669	6,749	6,806	6,804	6,786	7,087	7,627	7,589	7,674	7,839	7,923	7,997	6,898	6,867	6,858	6,737	6,982
United Kingdom	4,803	4,676	4,807	4,793	4,888	4,779	4,733	4,928	4,893	4,933	5,055	5,083	5,108	5,106	5,215	5,169	5,166	5,287	5,224	5,334
United States	1,776	1,807	1,854	1,801	1,771	1,769	1,778	1,752	1,754	440	432	430	440	443	437	447	442	438	441	451

Table 2. Real net minimum income benefit levels for lone parent household with two children

	1990	1991	1992	1993	1994	1995	1996	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009
Australia	12,477	12,835	13,243	13,643	13,831	13,650	14,018	15,296	15,106	15,087	14,323	16,173	16,135	16,277	17,403	17,392	17,593	17,684	17,935	18,265
Austria	11,993	11,613	12,200	12,734	12,648	12,957	12,456	12,084	12,035	12,634	12,767	12,755	12,942	12,984	13,136	13,078	13,363	13,398	13,722	13,802
Belgium	14,808	14,688	14,988	15,418	15,495	16,208	16,076	15,424	15,179	15,332	15,133	15,063	15,587	15,548	15,791	15,620	15,643	16,337	16,805	18,049
Bulgaria	3,720	3,348	3,852
Canada	19,136	19,888	20,144	20,082	20,431	19,248	16,265	16,025	15,899	15,945	15,814	15,704	15,537	15,376	15,630	15,879	17,925	17,879	17,225	17,016
Cyprus	10,860	10,993	11,251	10,899	11,551	12,945
Czech Republic	.	.	.	10,125	9,342	9,028	8,248	8,217	7,680	7,419	7,028	7,725	7,653	7,746	7,454	7,778	7,840	4,901	4,636	4,592
Denmark	11,802	12,015	12,579	12,741	14,537	14,666	14,688	14,657	14,821	14,886	14,694	14,771	14,873	15,131	15,544	16,197	16,123	16,326	15,808	16,245
Estonia	3,521	2,883	2,908	2,722	2,552	2,390	2,201	2,096	2,071	2,000	2,847	2,633	2,803	2,754	3,038
Finland	14,512	13,389	11,594	10,015	10,931	11,689	11,379	11,144	10,691	10,770	10,433	10,461	10,544	10,686	10,956	11,136	11,206	11,122	10,836	11,214
France	7,767	7,686	7,784	8,118	8,298	8,415	8,607	8,536	8,600	9,053	9,339	9,292	9,399	9,448	9,389	9,612	9,622	9,763	9,762	10,018
Germany	.	10,498	10,860	11,492	11,428	11,593	11,436	11,048	11,106	11,267	11,490	11,532	11,449	11,575	11,647	13,492	13,603	13,625	13,518	13,813
Hungary	.	.	17,402	16,965	14,357	9,061	6,489	4,968	4,096	3,702	3,240	2,878	2,735	2,891	2,904	2,862	4,004	6,365	6,183	5,829
Ireland	11,355	11,390	11,228	10,146	10,359	10,940	11,138	11,997	11,327	11,013	10,597	10,463	10,833	11,806	12,179	12,909	13,714	14,932	15,722	17,562
Italy	22,213	21,252	19,723	16,119	14,754	12,633	12,878	12,654	12,334	14,673	14,740	15,152	15,334	15,676	16,096	16,766	17,453	17,991	18,496	19,269
Japan	14,199	14,140	14,409	14,670	14,766	15,694	15,983	15,942	15,985	16,515	17,264	17,976	18,666	19,158	20,272	21,210	21,853	22,535	22,846	23,726
Latvia	2,231	2,291	2,317	2,125	1,670	2,263
Lithuania	2,973	2,840	2,988	3,562	3,766	5,219
Luxembourg	14,291	15,067	15,497	19,624	19,860	21,068	20,671	20,479	19,639	20,539	20,162	20,594	21,386	22,003	22,310	22,882	23,105	23,564	23,470	31,447
Malta	10,753	11,328	11,557	10,962	11,859	11,637
Netherlands	16,220	16,406	16,637	17,213	17,018	18,189	17,599	16,774	16,390	16,515	16,539	15,920	15,631	15,842	16,233	16,126	16,750	17,323	18,783	19,072
New Zealand	11,545	10,601	10,648	10,913	11,484	11,371	11,432	11,610	11,465	11,547	11,333	11,174	11,110	11,383	11,338	12,838	12,547	13,467	13,313	13,375
Norway	8,316	8,285	8,363	8,254	9,504	10,523	11,603	13,634	11,222	12,557	11,509	11,979	12,369	12,109	12,543	12,119	12,243	12,395	12,119	11,889
Poland	8,049	5,710	4,397	6,512	5,772	5,147	5,174	4,994	5,371	5,957	5,925	5,953	6,424	6,156	5,867
Portugal	5,442	5,613	5,578	5,761	5,850	5,811	5,849	5,792	6,115	6,408	6,502	6,618	6,928	7,250
Romania	1,777	1,606
Slovakia	.	.	.	7,371	5,356	4,888	5,238	5,715	5,623	4,801	4,444	4,152	4,351	3,419	2,541	2,608	2,714	3,147	3,696	3,990
Slovenia	16,231	14,299	13,760	11,071	9,565	12,445	11,548	11,048	11,239	11,221	11,282	11,672	11,552
Spain	17,681	16,222	14,343	11,790	10,229	9,699	9,351	8,752	8,400	8,250	8,414	8,758	8,531	8,578	8,619	8,573	8,420	8,512	8,472	8,922
Sweden	12,110	10,473	11,924	11,297	11,236	11,007	11,108	9,678	9,310	9,239	9,476	9,205	9,586	9,732	10,260	10,322	10,771	10,832	10,755	10,723
Switzerland	11,712	11,755	11,833	11,550	11,689	11,788	11,752	11,687	12,712	14,223	14,135	14,278	14,586	14,742	14,879	12,834	12,776	12,760	12,533	12,990
United Kingdom	10,053	9,787	10,195	10,147	10,347	10,114	9,998	10,378	10,581	10,959	11,691	12,183	13,097	13,217	14,049	13,146	14,220	14,619	15,063	15,396
United States	12,232	11,047	11,741	11,534	11,352	11,304	11,191	10,979	10,897	10,875	10,602	10,495	10,618	10,510	10,298	10,224	9,974	9,799	9,959	9,754

Table 3. Real net minimum income benefit levels for two parent household with two children

	1990	1991	1992	1993	1994	1995	1996	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009
Australia	17,116	18,244	18,826	19,254	19,518	19,211	19,727	21,131	20,911	20,845	19,761	21,769	21,740	21,920	23,103	23,156	23,443	23,557	23,740	24,176
Austria	14,546	14,086	14,937	15,570	15,314	15,710	15,169	15,372	15,036	15,345	15,466	15,467	15,716	15,721	15,929	15,866	16,681	16,814	17,102	17,137
Belgium	14,808	14,688	14,988	15,418	15,495	16,208	16,076	15,424	15,179	15,332	15,133	15,063	15,587	15,548	15,791	15,620	15,643	16,337	16,273	17,141
Bulgaria	4,089	3,659	4,567
Canada	21,698	22,570	22,792	22,716	22,911	21,451	18,193	17,861	17,540	17,409	17,023	16,712	16,409	16,165	16,330	16,637	19,135	19,108	18,566	18,656
Cyprus	13,788	13,958	14,289	13,831	14,710	16,518
Czech Republic	.	.	.	13,086	12,058	11,598	10,612	10,506	9,719	9,389	8,895	9,647	9,559	9,675	9,310	9,672	9,736	6,678	6,318	6,257
Denmark	15,556	15,684	16,284	16,498	23,936	23,964	23,859	23,673	25,004	26,184	26,375	26,515	26,669	27,066	27,289	28,209	28,342	28,712	27,803	28,734
Estonia	4,605	3,771	3,803	3,560	3,337	3,125	2,878	2,741	2,708	2,615	3,723	3,443	3,665	3,602	3,689
Finland	18,814	17,357	15,033	12,985	14,173	15,278	14,873	14,566	13,974	14,077	13,636	13,671	13,781	13,967	14,319	14,555	14,646	14,536	14,164	14,657
France	9,338	9,241	9,358	9,760	9,976	10,117	10,348	10,270	10,339	10,863	10,895	11,080	10,967	11,022	10,953	11,213	11,225	11,392	11,389	11,687
Germany	.	12,794	12,865	13,073	12,984	13,186	13,009	12,562	12,634	12,647	12,897	12,945	12,869	13,011	13,092	16,192	16,324	16,352	16,194	16,566
Hungary	.	.	23,296	23,630	21,318	13,510	9,563	7,247	5,921	5,307	4,730	4,269	4,128	4,268	4,332	4,243	5,604	6,194	5,967	5,625
Ireland	15,964	15,970	15,429	14,137	14,427	15,072	15,371	16,542	15,413	15,176	14,742	14,809	14,474	16,409	16,989	18,150	19,329	20,996	22,127	24,707
Italy	26,685	25,515	23,681	19,349	17,716	15,172	15,465	15,196	14,815	17,626	17,697	18,194	18,410	18,815	19,316	20,115	20,936	21,577	22,177	23,098
Japan	13,979	14,004	14,402	14,730	14,822	15,504	15,789	15,816	15,887	16,346	17,089	17,794	18,477	18,970	20,068	20,756	21,401	22,069	22,373	23,235
Latvia	2,975	3,055	3,090	2,833	2,226	3,017
Lithuania	3,964	3,787	3,984	4,749	5,195	6,958
Luxembourg	18,721	19,791	20,409	25,491	25,797	27,413	26,880	26,690	25,777	26,738	26,254	26,863	27,682	28,549	28,947	29,730	30,019	30,705	30,632	35,622
Malta	11,485	12,034	12,256	11,655	12,523	12,276
Netherlands	17,687	17,890	18,141	18,772	18,555	19,854	19,411	18,690	17,877	18,015	18,031	17,429	17,117	17,348	17,780	17,659	18,349	18,969	20,459	20,747
New Zealand	13,012	11,924	11,976	12,254	12,711	12,593	12,665	12,753	12,596	12,692	12,446	12,269	12,201	12,485	12,440	13,718	13,652	14,486	14,740	14,799
Norway	11,718	11,437	11,319	11,462	13,770	15,727	17,758	20,316	16,214	18,711	19,902	18,148	18,501	19,701	18,422	17,696	17,676	17,704	17,131	16,634
Poland	8,049	5,710	4,397	8,798	7,798	6,952	5,688	5,517	5,920	5,768	5,819	5,928	6,180	6,080	5,929
Portugal	7,840	7,971	7,922	8,187	8,314	8,254	8,307	8,233	8,669	9,107	9,249	9,411	9,699	10,168
Romania	2,148	1,896	1,930
Slovakia	.	.	.	12,286	8,927	8,146	8,151	8,436	7,959	6,568	6,076	5,675	5,946	5,045	3,916	4,020	4,205	4,919	5,492	5,800
Slovenia	20,259	17,727	16,657	11,843	10,189	13,796	12,761	12,172	12,391	12,371	12,439	12,802	12,690
Spain	19,390	17,791	15,730	12,930	11,218	10,640	10,258	9,601	9,215	9,050	9,210	9,596	9,348	9,377	9,656	9,608	9,438	9,548	9,497	9,994
Sweden	15,673	14,915	15,436	14,625	14,546	14,249	14,379	12,616	12,163	12,046	12,376	12,049	12,441	12,626	13,318	13,351	13,893	13,975	13,860	13,820
Switzerland	14,975	15,031	15,131	14,760	14,937	15,064	14,969	14,840	15,331	16,318	16,240	16,426	16,779	16,959	17,117	14,759	14,693	14,674	14,414	14,939
United Kingdom	12,164	11,841	12,296	12,315	12,486	12,203	12,081	12,577	12,911	13,460	14,275	14,798	15,748	16,102	16,857	15,926	16,988	17,462	17,873	18,272
United States	14,861	14,264	14,233	13,984	13,771	13,687	13,522	13,271	13,183	13,168	12,833	12,679	12,937	12,854	12,643	12,744	12,427	12,218	12,354	12,285

Table 4. Real net minimum income benefit levels (average of the three household types)

	1990	1991	1992	1993	1994	1995	1996	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009
Australia	12,231	12,847	13,256	13,544	13,687	13,524	13,885	14,855	14,685	14,633	13,870	15,229	15,210	15,332	16,144	16,163	16,376	16,455	16,569	16,874
Austria	10,545	10,211	10,866	11,322	11,188	11,484	11,109	10,996	10,865	11,226	11,311	11,308	11,496	11,486	11,645	11,601	12,034	12,105	12,327	12,398
Belgium	12,452	12,458	12,656	13,020	13,094	13,696	13,584	13,017	12,845	12,964	12,811	12,752	13,220	13,201	13,422	13,261	13,231	13,818	13,998	14,861
Bulgaria	3,013	2,682	3,205
Canada	16,311	16,985	17,210	17,155	17,389	16,323	13,761	13,542	13,349	13,301	13,072	12,881	12,679	12,508	12,667	12,851	14,345	14,356	14,010	13,924
Cyprus	10,145	10,270	10,516	10,176	10,833	12,161
Czech Republic	.	.	.	9,160	8,437	8,120	7,451	7,389	6,895	6,660	6,310	6,923	6,860	6,943	6,681	6,967	7,023	4,520	4,276	4,234
Denmark	10,806	10,921	11,363	11,512	15,247	15,777	15,728	15,625	16,149	16,581	16,594	16,692	16,796	17,065	17,363	17,955	18,028	18,262	17,684	18,247
Estonia	3,160	2,588	2,610	2,443	2,290	2,145	1,975	1,881	1,859	1,795	2,555	2,363	2,515	2,472	2,604
Finland	13,158	12,140	10,513	9,081	9,912	10,698	10,414	10,199	9,784	9,857	9,548	9,573	9,649	9,780	10,027	10,192	10,255	10,179	9,918	10,263
France	7,195	7,120	7,211	7,520	7,687	7,796	7,974	7,912	7,967	8,363	8,474	8,549	8,529	8,573	8,520	8,721	8,731	8,860	8,858	9,090
Germany	.	9,239	9,384	9,686	9,625	9,767	9,634	9,306	9,355	9,453	9,640	9,676	9,631	9,738	9,798	11,724	11,820	11,840	11,737	11,998
Hungary	.	.	15,898	16,157	14,502	9,188	6,508	4,936	4,035	3,618	3,220	2,903	2,804	2,907	2,950	2,889	3,793	4,949	4,666	4,399
Ireland	11,434	11,479	11,219	10,150	10,386	10,889	11,123	11,990	11,302	11,042	10,680	10,677	10,759	11,716	12,140	12,986	13,836	15,022	15,831	17,680
Italy	19,735	18,878	17,521	14,317	13,103	11,223	11,440	11,241	10,958	13,037	13,096	13,458	13,618	13,919	14,290	14,882	15,489	15,964	16,409	17,092
Japan	11,174	11,179	11,453	11,691	11,775	12,403	12,631	12,585	12,684	13,076	13,671	14,235	14,782	15,174	15,995	16,659	17,172	17,708	17,952	18,643
Latvia	1,983	2,036	2,060	1,889	1,484	2,012
Lithuania	2,643	2,525	2,656	3,166	3,463	4,639
Luxembourg	13,877	14,682	15,154	18,843	19,069	20,275	19,876	19,750	19,119	19,779	19,422	19,885	20,439	21,095	21,389	21,977	22,191	22,720	22,678	27,923
Malta	9,607	10,318	10,555	9,878	10,434	10,264
Netherlands	14,723	14,894	15,104	15,634	15,457	16,572	16,091	15,389	14,891	15,010	14,998	14,639	14,378	14,573	14,940	14,841	15,430	15,944	16,996	17,179
New Zealand	10,096	9,227	9,271	9,462	9,803	9,709	9,763	9,875	9,757	9,829	9,736	9,606	9,561	9,805	9,774	10,854	10,744	11,348	11,380	11,417
Norway	9,250	9,118	9,112	9,082	10,582	11,821	13,126	15,195	12,298	13,995	13,938	13,532	13,841	14,171	13,894	13,507	13,526	13,580	13,172	12,819
Poland	7,650	5,427	4,179	6,298	5,582	4,976	4,612	4,496	4,769	4,874	4,875	4,925	5,171	5,008	4,818
Portugal	5,226	5,314	5,281	5,458	5,542	5,503	5,538	5,489	5,779	6,071	6,166	6,274	6,475	6,787
Romania	1,509	1,331	1,353
Slovakia	.	.	.	7,917	5,753	5,250	5,414	5,739	5,521	4,631	4,285	4,002	4,193	3,363	2,671	2,742	2,865	3,350	3,754	3,971
Slovenia	13,680	11,978	11,282	8,673	7,454	10,191	9,420	8,979	9,142	9,127	9,177	9,434	9,354
Spain	16,153	14,821	13,104	10,772	9,346	8,870	8,552	8,004	7,682	7,545	7,643	7,980	7,777	7,759	7,823	7,786	7,655	7,747	7,717	8,134
Sweden	11,081	10,190	10,907	10,333	10,278	10,068	10,160	8,873	8,622	8,530	8,756	8,514	8,795	8,935	9,416	9,468	9,825	9,878	9,804	9,775
Switzerland	11,145	11,186	11,260	10,993	11,125	11,219	11,175	11,105	11,710	12,723	12,654	12,793	13,068	13,208	13,331	11,497	11,445	11,431	11,228	11,637
United Kingdom	9,006	8,768	9,099	9,085	9,240	9,032	8,937	9,294	9,462	9,784	10,341	10,688	11,318	11,475	12,040	11,413	12,125	12,456	12,720	13,001
United States	9,623	9,039	9,276	9,106	8,965	8,920	8,830	8,667	8,612	8,161	7,956	7,868	7,998	7,936	7,793	7,805	7,614	7,485	7,585	7,497

Table 5. Net minimum income replacement rate for single person household without children

	1990	1991	1992	1993	1994	1995	1996	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009
Australia	30	31	32	31	29	29	30	30	29	29	27	27	26	25	25	25	25	24	23	22
Austria	25	25	27	27	27	27	27	27	27	27	27	27	27	27	27	26	27	26	26	27
Belgium	38	38	37	38	38	39	39	38	39	38	38	38	39	38	38	36	35	35	36	37
Bulgaria	30	24	26
Canada	34	37	37	36	36	34	28	27	27	27	26	24	23	23	23	22	21	21	21	21
Cyprus	26	26	26	24	.	.
Czech Republic	.	.	.	40	37	36	33	34	35	32	32	36	34	33	30	30	28	15	14	14
Denmark	30	30	30	30	40	45	43	43	41	42	42	42	41	40	40	39	39	38	36	38
Estonia	17	17	17	16	16	14	13	12	11	10	13	11	11	10	11
Finland	32	30	31	32	31	30	28	27	27	25	25	24	23	23	22	22	21	21	20	20
France	29	29	28	29	29	29	30	28	28	28	28	28	28	27	27	27	27	26	26	26
Germany	20	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	20	20	20	20	23	23	23	22	23
Hungary	.	.	28	37	43	41	36	30	27	25	22	24	22	21	22	20	23	31	25	24
Ireland	33	34	33	31	31	32	32	32	32	31	29	28	29	30	30	32	34	34	35	36
Italy	33	34	34	35	32	31	29	28	28	34	34	35	36	36	36	37	38	39	39	40
Japan	27	27	28	28	28	28	27	27	28	29	29	28	29	29	29	29	29	29	29	30
Latvia	14	15	14	12	9	12
Lithuania	15	14	14	14	16	21
Luxembourg	36	36	38	45	45	46	45	47	44	45	44	44	42	44	45	45	45	46	45	53
Malta	38	43	43	37	37	37
Netherlands	46	47	48	47	46	48	47	44	43	44	43	43	40	40	40	39	39	40	40	39
New Zealand	30	26	26	26	26	26	25	25	24	24	25	24	24	24	24	26	26	25	25	24
Norway	39	37	35	35	38	40	42	48	39	43	43	44	43	43	41	39	38	36	35	35
Poland	57	45	36	37	33	31	32	32	31	30	29	28	26	24	23
Portugal	23	22	23	24	24	24	24	23	23	24	24	24	24	24
Romania	15	13	13
Slovakia	.	.	.	37	32	31	32	34	35	38	32	34	34	25	24	22	22	23	22	20
Slovenia	25	23	21	21	19	36	34	30	29	29	27	27	27
Spain	38	35	33	31	30	30	28	27	26	25	26	27	27	26	25	25	25	25	24	25
Sweden	34	32	32	33	32	32	31	27	26	25	25	24	24	25	25	24	23	23	22	21
Switzerland	26	26	27	26	26	26	26	26	27	28	28	28	27	27	27	22	21	21	21	20
United Kingdom	22	23	23	23	24	23	23	22	22	21	21	20	20	20	20	20	19	19	19	20
United States	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2

Table 6. Net minimum income replacement rate for lone parent household with two children

	1990	1991	1992	1993	1994	1995	1996	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009
Australia	48	48	49	49	47	47	48	49	48	48	46	50	48	47	48	48	48	45	45	43
Austria	48	48	49	49	48	49	48	48	48	48	47	47	48	47	48	47	48	47	48	48
Belgium	53	52	52	53	53	53	54	53	52	52	52	52	53	52	52	52	51	50	52	54
Bulgaria	79	67	71
Canada	70	75	74	74	74	70	59	58	58	57	56	54	52	51	52	50	57	55	52	51
Cyprus	47	46	46	41	.	.
Czech Republic	.	.	.	81	76	77	72	74	67	62	61	69	65	63	60	57	54	29	27	26
Denmark	56	56	57	57	62	60	59	58	57	59	57	57	56	56	56	56	55	54	52	53
Estonia	38	37	39	37	36	31	28	26	24	21	28	24	24	24	27
Finland	63	59	60	61	62	57	55	53	52	50	49	48	47	46	45	44	43	43	41	42
France	42	42	42	42	42	42	44	40	41	41	43	42	42	42	42	42	42	41	41	41
Germany	41	41	42	44	44	43	41	41	40	39	38	37	37	37	36	42	41	40	40	40
Hungary	.	.	50	59	61	57	54	47	43	39	33	33	30	31	31	30	41	67	66	63
Ireland	46	47	46	44	43	46	45	45	44	41	38	37	37	41	41	42	45	46	46	48
Italy	64	64	65	66	62	59	55	52	50	61	61	63	65	66	67	68	70	71	71	73
Japan	68	66	68	68	67	70	67	67	67	70	71	69	72	70	72	73	73	72	72	75
Latvia	37	37	36	30	23	31
Lithuania	42	37	37	39	40	56
Luxembourg	45	46	48	58	57	59	58	59	55	56	55	56	56	58	58	58	58	59	57	77
Malta	53	55	55	52	55	55
Netherlands	63	66	64	62	61	64	62	59	57	58	59	56	52	52	52	51	50	52	55	55
New Zealand	58	52	52	53	56	55	53	51	49	49	49	49	48	49	49	50	44	44	44	43
Norway	33	32	32	31	35	38	41	47	39	43	41	44	44	43	42	39	38	38	37	38
Poland	61	48	39	60	55	52	52	53	51	57	55	53	48	45	
Portugal	46	48	49	50	51	50	50	49	50	52	51	51	52	52
Romania	38	35	37
Slovakia	.	.	.	56	50	48	52	55	58	61	58	56	59	47	31	29	29	29	31	31
Slovenia	75	70	71	63	60	88	84	74	72	70	68	70	69
Spain	55	51	47	45	43	42	40	38	37	34	36	38	38	37	38	38	38	38	36	37
Sweden	65	56	62	63	63	63	62	54	50	49	47	45	47	47	48	46	46	45	43	42
Switzerland	40	40	41	39	38	39	38	38	41	45	45	44	44	43	43	36	35	34	34	33
United Kingdom	41	42	43	44	45	44	43	42	42	43	43	42	44	44	45	42	45	44	46	48
United States	44	40	43	42	41	41	40	39	38	36	36	35	34	33	33	32	31	31	31	29

Table 7. Net minimum income replacement rate for two parent household with two children

	1990	1991	1992	1993	1994	1995	1996	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009
Australia	66	68	70	69	67	66	67	68	66	66	64	68	65	63	63	64	64	61	59	57
Austria	58	58	60	60	59	59	59	61	59	58	57	57	58	57	58	58	60	59	60	59
Belgium	53	52	52	53	53	53	54	53	52	52	52	52	53	52	52	52	51	50	50	51
Bulgaria	87	73	85
Canada	79	85	84	83	83	78	66	64	64	62	61	57	55	54	54	53	61	58	56	56
Cyprus	59	58	58	52	.	.
Czech Republic	.	.	.	104	98	99	93	95	85	79	78	86	81	79	75	71	67	40	37	36
Denmark	74	74	74	74	103	98	96	94	96	103	102	102	101	100	98	98	96	94	91	94
Estonia	49	49	51	48	47	41	37	34	31	28	37	31	32	32	33
Finland	81	76	78	79	80	74	72	69	69	66	64	63	62	61	58	58	57	56	54	55
France	51	50	50	51	51	50	53	49	49	50	50	50	50	49	49	49	49	48	48	47
Germany	49	50	50	50	50	49	46	46	46	44	42	41	41	41	40	50	49	49	48	48
Hungary	.	.	67	83	91	85	79	69	62	56	48	49	46	45	47	45	58	65	64	61
Ireland	65	65	63	61	60	63	62	62	59	56	53	52	50	57	57	59	63	64	65	68
Italy	76	77	78	79	74	71	67	62	61	73	73	75	78	79	80	82	84	85	85	88
Japan	67	66	68	69	67	69	66	66	67	69	70	69	71	70	72	71	71	71	71	73
Latvia	49	49	48	40	31	41
Lithuania	56	49	49	52	55	75
Luxembourg	59	60	63	75	74	76	75	77	72	72	72	73	72	75	75	76	75	77	74	87
Malta	57	58	59	55	58	58
Netherlands	69	72	70	68	67	70	68	65	62	63	64	61	57	57	57	56	55	57	59	60
New Zealand	65	59	58	60	62	61	58	56	54	54	54	53	53	54	54	54	48	48	49	47
Norway	47	45	43	43	51	56	62	70	56	64	71	66	65	69	62	57	55	54	52	53
Poland	61	48	39	81	74	70	57	58	56	55	56	55	51	47	46
Portugal	67	68	70	71	72	71	70	69	71	73	73	72	73	73
Romania	46	42	45
Slovakia	.	.	.	94	83	80	81	81	83	84	80	77	80	69	48	45	45	46	47	45
Slovenia	93	87	86	68	63	97	93	81	79	77	74	76	76
Spain	60	56	51	49	47	47	44	42	41	38	40	42	41	41	43	42	43	42	41	41
Sweden	84	80	80	82	81	82	80	70	65	63	61	60	61	61	62	60	59	58	56	54
Switzerland	51	51	52	49	49	50	49	49	49	52	51	51	51	50	49	41	41	39	39	38
United Kingdom	50	51	52	53	54	53	52	50	51	53	52	51	53	53	54	51	53	53	55	57
United States	54	52	52	51	49	49	48	47	46	44	43	42	42	41	40	40	39	39	39	37

Table 8. Net minimum income replacement rate (average of the three household types)

	1990	1991	1992	1993	1994	1995	1996	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009
Australia	48	49	50	50	48	48	48	49	48	47	46	48	46	45	45	45	46	43	42	41
Austria	43	43	45	45	45	45	45	45	45	44	43	44	44	44	44	44	45	44	45	44
Belgium	48	47	47	48	48	49	49	48	48	48	48	47	48	48	48	46	46	45	46	47
Bulgaria	65	55	61
Canada	61	65	65	65	64	61	51	50	50	49	48	45	44	43	43	42	46	45	43	43
Cyprus	44	43	43	39	.	.
Czech Republic	.	.	.	75	70	71	66	68	62	58	57	64	60	58	55	53	50	28	26	25
Denmark	53	53	54	54	68	67	66	65	65	68	67	67	66	65	65	65	63	62	60	62
Estonia	35	34	36	34	33	28	26	24	22	20	26	22	22	22	24
Finland	59	55	56	57	58	53	52	50	49	47	46	45	44	43	42	41	40	40	38	39
France	41	40	40	41	41	40	42	39	39	40	41	40	40	40	39	39	39	38	38	38
Germany	37	37	38	39	38	38	36	36	36	34	34	33	33	33	32	38	38	37	37	37
Hungary	.	.	48	60	65	61	56	49	44	40	34	35	33	32	34	32	41	54	51	49
Ireland	48	49	47	45	45	47	46	46	45	43	40	39	39	43	42	44	47	48	48	51
Italy	58	58	59	60	56	54	50	47	46	56	56	58	60	60	61	62	64	65	65	67
Japan	54	53	55	55	54	56	53	53	54	56	56	55	57	56	58	57	58	57	57	60
Latvia	33	34	32	27	21	28
Lithuania	38	33	33	35	37	51
Luxembourg	47	48	50	59	58	60	60	61	57	57	57	57	57	59	59	60	59	60	59	72
Malta	49	52	52	48	50	50
Netherlands	59	62	60	59	58	61	59	56	54	55	55	53	50	50	50	49	48	49	51	52
New Zealand	51	46	45	46	48	47	45	44	42	42	42	42	42	42	42	43	39	39	40	38
Norway	40	38	37	36	42	44	48	55	45	50	52	51	51	52	49	45	44	43	41	42
Poland	60	47	38	59	54	51	47	48	46	48	48	46	43	40	38
Portugal	45	46	48	48	49	48	48	47	48	50	49	49	50	50
Romania	33	30	32
Slovakia	.	.	.	62	55	53	55	57	59	61	57	56	58	47	34	32	32	33	33	32
Slovenia	64	60	60	51	47	74	70	61	60	59	56	58	57
Spain	51	47	44	42	40	40	37	36	35	32	34	36	35	35	35	35	35	35	34	34
Sweden	61	56	58	59	59	59	58	50	47	46	44	43	44	44	45	43	43	42	40	39
Switzerland	39	39	40	38	38	38	38	38	39	42	41	41	41	40	39	33	32	31	31	31
United Kingdom	38	39	39	40	41	40	39	38	38	39	39	38	39	39	40	37	39	39	40	42
United States	35	33	34	33	32	32	32	31	30	27	27	26	26	25	25	25	24	24	24	23

References

- Allan, J. P., and Scruggs, L. (2004). Political partisanship and welfare state reform in advanced industrial societies. *American Journal of Political Science*, 48(3), 496-512.
- Been, J., and Van Vliet, O. (2017). Early retirement across Europe. Does non-standard employment increase participation of older workers? *Kyklos*, 70(2), forthcoming.
- Eardley, T., Bradshaw, J., Ditch, J., and Gough, I. (1996). Social assistance in OECD countries: Synthesis report. *HMSO Research Report no.47*. London: Department of Social Security.
- European Commission. (2014). *Exchange Rates Database*. Brussels.
- Ferrarini, T., Nelson, K., Korpi, W., and Palme, J. (2013). Social citizenship rights and social insurance replacement rate validity: pitfalls and possibilities. *Journal of European Public Policy*, 20(9), 1251-1266.
- Heston, A., Summers, R. and Aten, B. (2012). *Penn World Table Version 7.1*. Pennsylvania: University of Pennsylvania.
- Hicks, A., and Freeman, K. (2009). Pension income replacement: permanent and transitory determinants. *Journal of European Public Policy*, 16(1), 127-143.
- Immervoll, H. (2009). Minimum-income benefits in OECD countries: Policy design, effectiveness and challenges. *IZA Discussion Papers no. 4627*.
- Korpi, W., and Palme, J. (2003). New politics and class politics in the context of austerity and globalization: Welfare state regress in 18 countries, 1975–95. *American Political Science review*, 97(03), 425-446.
- Kuivalainen, S. (2003). How to compare the incomparable: an international comparison of the impact of housing costs on levels of social assistance. *European Journal of Social Security*, 5(2), 128-149.
- Marx, I., and Nelson, K. (2013). *Minimum Income Protection in Flux*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Nelson, K. (2013). Social assistance and EU poverty thresholds 1990–2008. Are European welfare systems providing just and fair protection against low income? *European Sociological Review*, 29(2), 386-401.
- Olaskoaga, J., Alaez-Aller, R., and Diaz-De-Basurto-Uraga, P. (2013). Beyond welfare effort in the measuring of welfare states. *Journal of Comparative Policy Analysis: Research and Practice*, 15(3), 274-287.
- Scruggs, L., Detlef, J. and Kuitto, K. 2014. *Comparative Welfare Entitlements Dataset 2: Version 2014-03*. University of Connecticut and University of Greifswald.
- Van Mechelen, N., Marchal, S., Goedeme, T., Marx, I., and Cantillon, B. (2011). The CSB-Minimum Income Protection Indicators Dataset (CSB-MIPI). *CSB Working Paper no. 11/05*.

- Van Vliet, O., and Caminada, K. (2012). Unemployment Replacement Rates Dataset among 34 Welfare States 1971-2009: An Update, Extension and Modification of Scruggs' Welfare State Entitlements Data Set. *NEUJOBS Special Report* no. 2.
- Van Vliet, O., and Wang, C. (2015). Social investment and poverty reduction: A comparative analysis across 15 European countries. *Journal of Social Policy* 44(3): 611-638.
- Wang, J., and Van Vliet, O. (2014). Social assistance and minimum income benefits: Benefit levels, replacement rates and policies across 33 countries, 1990-2009. *Department of Economics Research Memorandum* no. 2014.04. Leiden: Leiden University.
- Wang, J., and Van Vliet, O. (2016). Social assistance and minimum income benefits: Benefit levels, replacement rates and policies across 26 OECD countries, 1990-2009. *European Journal of Social Security* 18(4): 333-555.
- Wang J., Van Vliet, O. and Goudswaard, K. (2015). Social assistance benefits and European coordination. *Department of Economics Research Memorandum* no. 2015.02. Leiden: Leiden University.
- Whiteford, P. (1995). The use of replacement rates in international comparisons of benefit systems. *International Social Security Review*, 48(2), 3-30.
- World Bank. (2012). *World Development Indicators*. Washington.